

A VIRTUAL JEWISH WORLD

Ruth Ellen Gruber

'Berlin boasts its own klezmer bands, and Jewish thought/Jewish art/Jewish spirit is everywhere on the shelves and on the airwaves', read the liner notes for the CD *Beyond the Pale* by the American klezmer group Brave Old World. 'In 1993, Germany is one of a very few countries where you can make a living playing Jewish music. But for whom? *A bord on a yid?* . . . A beard without a Jew behind it?'

Over the past couple of decades, and particularly since the fall of communism in 1989–1990, Europe has seen the growth of a phenomenon whereby the 'Jewish phenomenon' – anything to do with Judaism, Jews, Jewish culture, the Holocaust, and Israel – has been increasingly recognised as part of national history and culture and embraced by the mainstream, on both the official and the personal levels. As part of this trend, Jewish culture – or what passes for Jewish culture, or what is perceived or defined as Jewish culture – has become a visible and sometimes highly visible component of the popular public domain, including popular culture, in countries where Jews themselves now are practically invisible. In one form or another, this is a Europe-wide phenomenon, observable in countries whose people were the perpetrators as well as the victims and bystanders of the Second World War and the Holocaust; in countries on both sides of Europe's north–south axis; in countries that straddle the one-time Iron Curtain that divided the Soviet Bloc from Western democracy; in countries where anti-Semitism is also still alive and sometimes openly voiced.

It is manifested in a wide variety of ways, from the scholarly to the superficial: numerous conferences are held each year on all aspects of Jewish history, culture, and tradition, and numerous academic study programmes, courses, or lecture series on Jewish topics have been established in many countries since the mid to late 1980s. The European Association of Jewish Studies (EAJS) was founded in 1981 as an international voluntary association and began organising annual international Jewish studies conferences in the early 1990s. It established a permanent secretariat in 1995. Its first *Directory of Jewish Studies in Europe*, published in 1998, listed nearly 300 institutions and university departments in 22 European countries (outside the former Soviet Union) where Jewish studies courses or classes were taught. It also listed nearly one thousand Europe-based scholars who taught (or in some cases carried out research in) various areas of Jewish studies.¹

Jewish exhibitions, festivals, and workshops of all types abound. Some are organised by Jewish communities; but many are sponsored by local authorities, or sponsored jointly by Jewish bodies and non-Jewish public or private bodies.

A project sponsored by the London-based Institute for Jewish Policy Research (JPR) charted all Jewish cultural events that took place between May 2000 and April 2001 in four countries with small Jewish populations -- Italy, Belgium, Sweden and Poland.. Researchers counted well over 700 events in all four countries, including 27 separate Jewish cultural festivals – thirteen of them in Italy alone. It counted nearly 200 one-off Jewish cultural events and fully seven Jewish cultural festivals in Poland, a country whose Jewish population is estimated at between 5,000 and 20,000.

One of the best known international Jewish festivals, in fact, is the annual summer Festival of Jewish Culture held in Kazimierz, the old Jewish quarter of Cracow, which was founded by two young, non-Jewish intellectuals, Janusz Makuch and Krzysztof Gierat, in 1988, before the fall of communism. Makuch had first learned about Jews as a teenager in the late 1970s from an old Polish professor, at a time when Jewish topics were virtually taboo. He felt he was discovering a new, hidden world that caused him to view his country's and his own identity in a different light. 'It was like a discovery of Atlantis that people lived here and created their own original culture and had such a deep influence on Polish culture', he has recalled. He felt it a duty to recover and resurrect this, as a homage to the three million Polish Jews killed in the Holocaust, and also as testimony to the thousand-year history of Jews in Poland. By now, the Festival has become a summer staple, drawing thousands of people, mostly non-Jewish Poles, to concerts, performances, exhibitions, lectures, and workshops: in 2001, Polish President Aleksander Kwasniewski himself wrote a Foreword to the Festival's thick, souvenir program.

In 1992, in Berlin – home to about 9,000 Jews at the time – a huge exhibition at the Martin Gropius Bau museum called '*Jüdische Lebenswelten*' [Patterns of Jewish life], was described as 'the world's largest and most

¹ *Directory of Jewish Studies in Europe*, ed. Annette Winkelmann (Oxford: European Association of Jewish Studies, 1998). A similar catalogue of Jewish studies courses in the United States and Canada was first published in 1979 by the Association of Jewish Studies, in association with the B'nai B'rith Hillel Foundations. For a detailed examination of Jewish studies in Germany, see the 'Special Issue on Historical Memory and the State of Jewish Studies in Germany', *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies* 15, No. 4 (summer 1997).

expensive Jewish exhibit ever'.² Sponsored by the city and costing more than USD 6 million to mount, the exhibition spilled far outside the walls of the museum to include a wealth of related performances, conferences, poetry readings, film series, specialised exhibitions, and concerts – even a double CD. Some 350,000 people saw the exhibition, and 115,000 attended the related events. Some 60,000 copies were sold of the catalogue, which was nearly 800 pages long and included more than 740 illustrations.³

In addition to large-scale festivals, numerous readings, lectures, seminars, talk shows, and films spotlighting Jewish issues, as well as articles and programmes on Jewish subjects are given frequent and prominent space in newspapers and magazines and on primetime TV. Hundreds – thousands – of new books on Jewish topics are published annually in local languages, and new Jewish bookstores attract a wide clientele in Munich, Vienna, Berlin, Cracow, Rome.

Fiddler on the Roof is a favourite on local stages, as are many other plays and performances on a variety of Jewish themes, and Yiddish song, klezmer music, and other Jewish music – performed by Jewish groups and local non-Jewish groups alike – draw enthusiastic audiences in concert halls, churches, clubs, and outdoor arenas. In many cases the label 'Jewish' has become a category of commercial merchandise. Scores of klezmer groups, ranging from professional bands to local amateur associations, exist in Germany alone, and klezmer bands make regular concert tours of European countries. There have been numerous klezmer and Jewish music festivals since the 1980s; in Italy, the annual International Klezmer Festival in Ancona, founded in 1996, has become a major summer event.

Private volunteers and civic organisations clear up abandoned Jewish cemeteries and place plaques on empty synagogues. Local and state governments help fund the restoration of ruined or abandoned synagogues. New Jewish museums are opening their doors – often in towns where no Jews have lived for decades – in synagogues newly restored after lying in ruins since the end of the Second World War, or newly rediscovered under layers of post-war transformation into apartment houses, warehouses, or fire stations. Since 1988, new Jewish museums or exhibitions have opened in Germany, Austria, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, France, Italy, Bulgaria, Greece, and elsewhere. Several dozen have opened in Germany alone, ranging from large-scale museums in Frankfurt and Berlin to small private collections. Scholars, archivists, museum directors, and researchers from more than 40 institutions all over Germany attended the 1997 annual meeting in Cologne of Germany's Association of Jewish Collections.

Jewish-theme tourism, meanwhile, has become a well-established niche in the vast tourist market, promoted on the private level and also strongly backed by state, city, or regional authorities. Numerous new Jewish guidebooks, brochures, Jewish heritage maps, posters, and other material have been published, and new travel agencies have opened to specialise in Jewish tours. An annual European Day of Jewish Culture, on which hundreds of Jewish sites in various countries are opened simultaneously to the public, was established in 2000, attracting scores of thousands of visitors.

Old Jewish quarters are under development as tourist attractions in Alsace, Berlin, Cracow, Spain, Venice, and beyond. Some boast 'Jewish-style' shops, galleries, and cafes; some of the 'Jewish-style' restaurants name their dishes – sometimes dishes made from pork or a non-kosher mix of meat and dairy products – after rabbis and Old Testament prophets: 'Rabbi Löw Beefsteaks' made with ketchup, cheese, ham and mushrooms, 'Merchant Samuel Pork', and a 'Rabbi's Pocket' filled with smoked meat and garnished with cheese, for example, have all appeared on the menu of the Golem restaurant in Prague's old Jewish quarter.

New Jewish kitsch fills kiosks, shops, and market stalls – everything from T-shirts and postcards to souvenir Jewish figurines: wooden carvings of hook-nosed, bearded Jews in Poland; Golem statuettes and sidelocked Jewish puppets in Prague; and brightly coloured miniature Jews of hand-blown Murano glass in Venice. The Seven Forty restaurant in St. Petersburg features decor that is supposed to evoke life in the Shtetl. Reads its brochure: "That 'Seven Forty' is nothing but a Jewish restaurant is undoubted. To identify its character it is not at all necessary to look at the menu, it is enough to glance at the furniture of the restaurant styled as a dwelling of a poor Jewish family. A significant part of 'Seven Forty' is a straw covered hut, whose owner is an old Jewish bootmaker mending a boot of a grey-bearded fellow-villager. In the house of the bootmaker everything is authentic: a violin on the wall, cupboards with a polished Primus-stove and an oil lamp, an old waistcoat hanging on the nail, etc. There are many touching and well considered particulars in the interior. As often happens in a poor house one of the walls is covered with the yellowing pages of a newspaper of the beginning of the century. The cuisine and attention to details all go to make this a truly natural Jewish experience. Only the simplest of natural products are used to produce tasteful meals that our Jewish clientele expects and enjoys."

Much of this interest (and even much of the kitsch) is commonplace in countries like the United States, where there is a big internal Jewish market. (Not to mention Israel, where the Jewish market *is* the mainstream.) The

² Y. Michal Bodemann, 'A Reemergence of German Jewry?', in *Reemerging Jewish Culture in Germany: Life and Literature since 1989*, ed. Sander L. Gilman and Karen Remmler (New York: NYU Press, 1994), p. 57.

³ *American Jewish Yearbook 1994*, p. 322.

irony in most of Europe, though, is that the internal market hardly exists. Jews themselves (including local communities and visiting tourists) do make up some of the participants, sponsors, and targeted public for the instances listed above, but for the most part performers, organisers, audiences, participants, and consumers are non-Jews.

In the mid 1990s, sociologist Y. Michal Bodemann described the specific manifestation of this phenomenon in Germany as the emergence of a 'Judaising terrain' made up of 'converts to Judaism, of members of joint Jewish-German or Israeli-German associations, and of many 'professional almost-Jews' outside or even inside the apparatuses of the Jewish organisations and [Jewish communities]'. Jewish culture, he wrote,

is being manufactured, Jewish history reconstructed, by these Judaising milieus – by German experts of Jewish culture and religion [who] enact Jewish culture from within German biographies and from within German history; this has an important bearing on the type of Jewish culture that is actually being produced: a culture that is not lived, that draws heavily from the museum, and that is still no less genuine for that.⁴

Paris-based historian Diana Pinto uses the term 'Jewish Space' to describe the place occupied by the Jewish phenomenon within mainstream European society today.⁵ Jewish Space, she writes, entails not so much the physical presence of Jews, but the ways in which European countries now integrate Jewish history and memory, and also the Holocaust, into an understanding of their national history, regardless of the current size or activity of the local Jewish population.⁶ 'There is a Jewish Space in Europe that will exist even in the absence of Jews', Pinto told a 1995 conference in Prague on Planning for the Future of European Jewry. 'The "Jewish thing"', she said, 'is becoming universal'.

I think of this 'universalisation' of the Jewish phenomenon and its integration into mainstream European consciousness, this emergence of a 'Judaising terrain' and 'Judaising milieu' in all their widely varied, conscious and unconscious manifestations, as a 'filling' of the Jewish space which encompasses the creation of a 'Virtual Jewishness', a 'Virtual Jewish World' by non-Jews – 'Virtual Jews'.

It is they who, in the absence of significant Jewish populations create a sort of parallel universe by performing or taking over cultural and other activities which would ordinarily be carried out by Jews. (There are about 35,000 known Jews in Italy; 5,000–20,000 in Poland; 4,000 in Slovakia; 10,000 in Austria. Thanks to immigrants from the former Soviet Union, the Jewish population in Germany has doubled in the 1990s to 100,000.) Some non-Jews go so far as to wear stars of David around their necks, assume Jewish-sounding names, attend synagogue, send their children to Jewish schools, establish twin cities relationships with Israeli towns, in addition to championing Jewish causes.

'Considering the number of publications, exhibits, and the large focus on Jewish topics in the media', German journalist Katharina Ochse told a 1993 conference on Emerging Jewish Culture in Germany since 1989, 'one could get the impression that the country had a few hundred thousand Jews and a blossoming German Jewish culture.'⁷ Likewise, according to surveys cited but not identified by Polish author Agata Tuszynska, 'One in four Poles is convinced that from 350,000 to 3.5 million Jews are living in Poland. One in ten believes that there are significantly more, perhaps 4 million, perhaps as many as 7 million.'⁸ Various surveys carried out in the 1980s and 1990s in Italy, too, showed that Italians consistently overestimate the number of Jews in the country by hundreds of thousands or even millions.⁹ Indeed, in the summer of 1998, a senior staff member at a local history museum in the North-Eastern Italian town of Gorizia, on the border with Slovenia, told me that she guessed there must be about 500,000 Jews in Italy – some fifteen times the actual number. ('I know there are only a small number of Jews in Italy', she told me, 'and 500,000 seems small in a country with 60 million people'.)

⁴ Bodemann, 'A Reemergence of German Jewry?', in *Reemerging Jewish Culture in Germany*, pp. 57–58. This book is an invaluable examination of the phenomenon in Germany. See also the book of essays *Jews, Germans, Memory*, ed. Y. Michal Bodemann (Ann Arbor: Michigan University Press, 1996).

⁵ See my paper 'Filling the Jewish Space in Europe', published in 1996 by the American Jewish Committee. In his book *Jewish Icons: Art and Society in Modern Europe* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998), Richard I. Cohen uses the term 'Jewish public space' to describe areas in which Jews interacted with or portrayed themselves to the surrounding mainstream Christian world in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. See, for example, p. 70.

⁶ See Diana Pinto, *A New Jewish Identity for post-1989 Europe*. JPR Policy Paper No. 1. (London: Institute for Jewish Policy Research, June 1996).

⁷ Katharina Ochse, "What Could Be More Fruitful, More Healing, More Purifying? Representations of Jews in the German Media after 1989," in *Reemerging Jewish Culture in Germany*, p. 113.

⁸ Agata Tuszynska, *Lost Landscapes: In Search of Isaac Bashevis Singer and the Jews of Poland* (New York: William Morrow, 1998), p. 98.

⁹ Estimates ranged routinely from 500,000 to 5 million. There are actually about 35,000 Jews in Italy. Information on these surveys from Tullia Zevi, former president of the Union of Italian Jewish Communities, and Annie Sacerdoti, editor of the Milan Jewish magazine *Il Bollettino*.

The motivations behind the non-Jewish embrace of the Jewish phenomenon are as varied as the manifestations, ranging from serious scholarly pursuit to political correctness to what can be viewed as 'post-Holocaust necrophilia'. It is easy to dismiss much of the phenomenon as opportunistic 'Shoah business', or a debased form of folklore, and some of it obviously *is* exploitative kitsch. But the phenomenon is much more complex and, I believe, in many cases runs considerably deeper.

Clearly, various degrees of philo-Semitism – an idealisation of Jews, sometimes linked to guilt or uneasiness about the Holocaust, sometimes linked to a fascination with what is perceived as an almost familiar exotica – play a role. In Germany in particular, the impact of the Nazi legacy has had a major impact. But elsewhere, too, Jews and 'things Jewish' can be and are used as symbols – symbols of survival, self-irony, and identity maintained in exile; symbols of the Holocaust; symbols of what was suppressed under communism; symbols of all oppressed peoples; symbols of democratic ideals.

Nostalgia, too, is involved, though nostalgia is likely to be (at least initially) a pseudo-nostalgia for stereotypes – be it the stage-set *shtetl* world of *Fiddler on the Roof* or a romanticised vision of the coffee house Jewish intellectual. Jews as symbols of 'the good old days', perhaps. Fashion can play a big role, too, making 'things Jewish' an ethnic flavour of the month in societies where 'world music' and 'multiculturalism' are chic contemporary catchwords.

The phenomenon is manifested on a purely personal level but also as a conscious part of public policy, by local and national authorities as well as by pan-European institutions: in 1987, for example, the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe passed a resolution recognising 'the very considerable and distinctive contribution that Jews and the tradition of Judaism have made to the historical development of Europe in the cultural and other fields',¹⁰ The non-Jewish embrace of 'things Jewish' has expanded and diversified rather than contracted since the early 1980s, and has become well entrenched in the most diverse of European societies, so much so that at least some aspects (such as the klezmer craze) may have 'peaked' in some places and simply become the norm.

The trend assumes new and changing forms as it evolves. What started out in many cases as the private explorations of a limited number of intellectuals has often become institutional and also now the province of a much wider, more casual, popular participation and acknowledgement. Generational changes also have had and continue to have an effect; 'serious' motivations have given way in many cases to pop expression and simple cultural curiosity, and vice-versa. For many, particularly younger, people, 'things Jewish' may simply be a fun offering on the shelves of today's cultural supermarket. But for others, casual pop encounters have led to a much deeper academic, artistic, humanitarian, or other involvement. If anything can be described as a common denominator, it is, perhaps, the recovery of the past; the recovery and then use of memory. Holocaust commemoration *per se* is only part of the equation.

A question of timing is involved: in many ways, at least initially, the phenomenon was a reflection of a 'third generation' syndrome, the desire to find out and seize hold of knowledge withheld, denied, or ignored by older generations, be they parents, grandparents, or ruling elites. Part of this included, for example, young Germans openly confronting their parents about their wartime history as they came of age in the 1960s and 1970s. Other catalysts included the opening of the Christian world, and particularly the Roman Catholic world, to Jews and 'things Jewish', which was also initiated in the 1960s and gained momentum as the post-war student generations came of age. Pope John Paul II, who lived through the horrors of German occupation in his native Poland and had firsthand experience of the effects of the Holocaust and of communist anti-Semitism, in particular made bettering relations with the Jewish world one of the cornerstones of his mission after he was elected to the papacy in 1978; this was crowned by his trip to Israel in March 2000. The role of Israel itself on the world stage, and shifting attitudes toward the Jewish State in light of developments such as the Six-Day-War in 1967, the Intifada, the Gulf War, and the ups and downs of the 'peace process', also have focused attention on Jews and 'things Jewish' in general and influenced European attitudes toward them, both on the governmental and personal planes. Finally, it took the waning and collapse of communism to make confrontation with history and the historical legacy the norm, in the east as well as the west.

Jews themselves have not been immune to all these changes. Parallel to the development of a non-Jewish embrace of 'things Jewish' in Europe, there has been an internal Jewish rediscovery of roots and heritage, too, particularly since the fall of communism. Indeed, the embrace of Jewish culture by mainstream society has gone on side by side (and at times hand in hand) with efforts by Jews themselves to recover or redefine personal Jewish identities and to revive or enrich Jewish communities, Jewish life, and internal Jewish culture in various countries.

'Memory lapses' regarding Jewish heritage and history, as well as the Holocaust, were the result of more than Second World War annihilation. Depending on local political conditions, they were created and bolstered after

¹⁰ Miguel Angel Mart'nez, rapporteur, *The Jewish Contribution to European Culture*, Report of the Committee on Culture and Education (Strasbourg: Council of Europe, 1987).

the war by wilful public amnesia, deliberate political agendas, or apathetic neglect – or a combination of all three.

Nowadays, more than half a century after the end of the Second World War, the memory of Jews can be employed as a vehicle for self-discovery and self-exploration. The mainstream recovery of Jewish history and culture as well as Holocaust memory can be used as a means of re-thinking and re-defining both personal identity and national histories, in a process that is both conscious and unconscious. It may entail what some Germans label deliberate ‘memory work’, a meticulous, sometimes ritualised approach to bringing to light that which the wartime generation sought to bury, as part of the process of *Vergangenheitsverarbeitung* or coming to terms with the past. Or it may be part of what East Europeans dubbed ‘filling in the blank spaces’ created by communist ideology. It may be an intellectual or emotional attraction to Jews, and to their lost world, as metaphorical symbols. Or it may be a much less complicated attraction to local legend and lore.

The history and memory that are resurrected are often distorted or codified to suit specific local and personal needs. They must coexist with present and past realities, and sometimes do so uneasily. Sincere attempts to reintegrate what has been lost, destroyed, or forgotten coexist with superficiality, slogans, and show: ‘Jewish chic’. Nostalgia, stereotypes, and commemoration can become shorthand tools in the creation of what often, to rework a concept expressed by Umberto Eco in a 1975 essay on aspects of popular culture in America, become ‘absolute fake’ environments; ‘where the boundaries of game and illusion are blurred’ and where ‘absolute unreality is offered as a real presence’.¹¹

I witnessed a vivid example of this in 1997 in the Italian city of Trieste, during a month long festival of Jewish culture called Shalom Trieste, which was sponsored by local authorities and encompassed exhibitions, performances, tours, and other events. As part of the festival, Jewish singer/actor Moni Ovadia, Italy’s most famous and popular interpreter of Jewish-theme productions, produced a musical theatre piece about the Jewish history and associations of Trieste, which opened the season of one of Trieste’s leading theatres. Ovadia, a Bulgarian-born Sephardi Jew who grew up in Milan, today draws rave reviews and thousands of spectators all over Italy to stage performances based on East European Jewish culture, often partly performed in Yiddish. A veteran folk singer and performer who began devoting the bulk of his work to Jewish and Yiddish themes in the 1980s, Ovadia was one of the chief catalysts of the mainstream craze for Jewish music, performance, humour, and other Jewish cultural products in Italy that developed in the 1990s.

The premiere of his Trieste show took place in October, on the eve of the Jewish holiday Simhat Torah, a joyous festival marking the conclusion of the year-long cycle of the reading of the Torah in synagogue. Before going to the theatre, I attended services in Trieste’s synagogue, a magnificent structure built in 1912. Only about 700 Jews live in Trieste today; some 200 or so were in the congregation. Men paraded around the sanctuary carrying Torahs bedecked with jingling silver, and at least a score of young children marched behind them waving flags; then half a dozen men danced with the Torahs in front of the Holy Ark. It was, for all the small size of the Jewish community and disrepair of the enormous synagogue, a scene that was joyous and redolent of Jewish life and tradition.

The theatre, a few blocks away, was sold out for Moni Ovadia’s performance; the audience was several times larger than the congregation in the synagogue. The performance consisted largely of Ovadia reading excerpts from books about the Jewish experience in Trieste, interspersed with songs, klezmer music, and Jewish jokes. He frequently cited works by Claudio Magris, a prominent local scholar and writer whose works dating back to the early 1970s introduced many Italians to the pre-war world of East European Jewry. Ovadia repeatedly referred to Magris, who himself was sitting in the audience, as his ‘guide’.

But he made no mention at all that the premiere was taking place on an important Jewish holiday, and that a synagogue service was going on at that very moment just a 15-minute walk away, and that there was a living congregation of Jews still active in the city. Instead, as the final scene of the stage show, Ovadia dramatically turned off a light, plunging the theatre into darkness and symbolically indicating – to the overwhelmingly non-Jewish crowd – that Triestine Jewish life was no more.

Jews themselves have not been immune to the changes and trends I have noted. On the contrary. Parallel to the development of a non-Jewish embrace of ‘things Jewish’ in Europe, there has been an internal Jewish rediscovery of roots and heritage, too, particularly since the fall of communism. Indeed, the embrace of Jewish culture by mainstream society has gone on side by side (and at times hand in hand) with efforts by Jews themselves to recover or redefine personal Jewish identities and to revive or enrich Jewish communities, Jewish life, and internal Jewish culture in various countries.

And there is a growing sense of urgency among Jews that unless they themselves take positive action, the ‘Jewish thing’ may become hijacked if not watered down to a homeopathic degree: Jewish cultural products

¹¹ Umberto Eco, *Travels in Hyperreality* (New York: Harcourt Brace & Company, 1986), pp. 8, 7. See the discussion of virtuality in Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, *Destination Culture: Tourism, Museums, and Heritage* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998).

displacing Jewish culture. Indeed, an affirmation that Jews and Jewish culture are not simply dusty or sanctified museum relics is essential. Without a living Jewish dimension, the Virtual Jewish World may become a sterile desert – or a haunted Jewish never-never land. Some Jews have begun taking positive steps to help chart future development of the phenomenon by making sure that there is actual living Jewish input, and Jewish organizations are trying to evolve strategies.

Responses to these issues may be the key to the future. But these responses, too, are in flux.

“There is a problem of representation”, British scholar Jonathan Webber told a February conference in Paris on Jewish Culture in the 21st Century. “There is a difference between official, established Judaism and how Jews actually live. And there is an imagined Judaism, created *ex nihilo*. How do we Jews represent Jewish culture in relation to ourselves, to non-Jews, in the media? Should we participate or stand by?”

Not only that, he warned. “Representation is a moving target. Jewish culture is undergoing such changes that to pin it down to one representation is an illusion.”